

ISSN 1178-2560 Decision Series Project no. 14.18/0044019

Public version

Cost of capital determination for disclosure year 2025 for information disclosure regulation

For Enable Networks Limited

[2024] NZCC 16

The Commission: Tristan Gilbertson

Vhari McWha

Nathan Strong

Date of publication: 1 August 2024

Associated documents

Publication date	Reference	Title		
1 July 2024	ISSN 1178-2560	Cost of capital determination for Chorus' price quality path for PQP2 [2024] NZCC 12		
27 June 2024	ISBN 978-1- 869457-90-7	Guidelines for WACC determinations under the cost of capital input methodologies - Regulation under Part 4 of the Commerce Act 1986 and Part 6 of the Telecommunications Act 2021 (Pre-IM review version)		
28 May 2024	ISSN 1178 – 2560	Fibre Input Methodologies (tax-adjusted market risk premium) Amendment Determination 2024 [2024] NZCC 11		
1 May 2024	ISSN 1178-2560	Cost of capital determination for disclosure year 2025 for information disclosure regulation, For Tuatahi First Fibre Limited and Northpower Fibre Limited [2024] NZCC 8		
7 February 2024	ISSN 1178-2560	Cost of capital determination for disclosure year 2024 for information disclosure regulation, For Chorus Limited [2024] NZCC 1		
1 August 2023	ISSN 1178-2560	Cost of capital determination for disclosure year 2024 for information disclosure regulation, For Enable Networks Limited [2023] NZCC 19		
1 May 2023	ISSN 1178-2560	Cost of capital determination for disclosure year 2024 for information disclosure regulation, For Tuatahi First Fibre Limited and Northpower Fibre Limited [2023] NZCC 9		
1 February 2023	ISSN 1178-2560	Cost of capital determination disclosure year 2023 for information disclosure regulation, For Chorus Limited [2023] NZCC 1		
2 August 2022	ISSN 1178-2560	Cost of capital determination disclosure year 2023 for information disclosure regulation, For Enable Networks Limited		
3 May 2022	ISSN 1178-2560	Cost of capital determination for Tuatahi First Fibre Limited and Northpower Fibre Limited ID [2022] NZCC 13		

1 February 2022	ISSN 1178-2560	Cost of capital determination for Chorus, Enable, Tuatahi, and Northpower Fibre ID [2022] NZCC 1
30 November 2021	ISSN 1178-2560	Fibre Information Disclosure Determination 2021 (as amended)
1 July 2021	ISSN 1178-2560	Cost of capital determination for Chorus' price quality path for PQP1 [2021] NZCC 8
13 October 2020	ISSN 1178-2560	Fibre Input Methodologies Determination 2020 [2020] NZCC 21, as amended

Commerce Commission Wellington, New Zealand

WACC estimates for disclosure year 2025 for Enable Networks Limited

- 1. This cost of capital determination has been made under the Cost of Capital Input Methodologies (IMs).¹
- 2. This determination specifies the weighted average cost of capital (WACC) estimates that will apply for information disclosure (ID) regulation for disclosure year 2025 for Enable Networks Limited (Enable).
- 3. The timing of our WACC determinations for Fibre ID regulation differs depending on the disclosure year of the regulated companies.² We determine an ID WACC for Enable in July each year as its disclosure year is 1 July to 30 June, with disclosure year 2025 being the year ending 30 June 2025.^{3, 4}
- 4. The vanilla and post-tax WACC estimates for disclosure year 2025 for Enable are summarised in Table 1 below.

Table 1: Vanilla and post-tax WACC estimates

	Mid-point
Vanilla WACC	8.03%
Post-tax WACC	7.50%
Standard error	0.0131

5. The WACC estimates have been calculated as at 1 July 2024, which is the first day of disclosure year 2025 for Enable.

¹ Commerce Commission, Fibre Input Methodologies Determination 2020 [2020] NZCC 21 (as amended). An unofficial consolidated version incorporating amendments to the determination is <u>available on the Commission's website</u>.

² Commerce Commission, Fibre Input Methodologies Determination 2020 [2020] NZCC 21 (as amended).

The input methodologies require us to make the determinations for all regulated fibre service providers other than Chorus Limited (Chorus) within one month of the start of the disclosure year for all disclosure years except for disclosure year 2022.

We determine an ID WACC for Chorus in January or February each year as its disclosure years is 1 January to 31 December. The IMs require us to make the determinations for Chorus within two months of the start of the disclosure year. We determine an ID WACC for Tuatahi First Fibre Limited (Tuatahi) and Northpower Fibre Limited (Northpower Fibre) in April each year as their disclosure years are 1 April to 31 March.

- 6. This determination applies the IMs as they applied before Fibre tax-adjusted market risk premium IM amendment of 28 May 2024.⁵ This is because the amendments to the IM determination do not apply for ID until 3 March 2025.⁶
- 7. The IMs set out the methodology for determining an estimate of WACC, including:
 - 7.1 the formulas used;
 - 7.2 the values for WACC parameters which are fixed under the IMs; and
 - 7.3 our methodology for determining the risk-free rate and average debt premium.

Further details regarding the WACC estimates

WACC parameter values for Enable

8. The parameter values used to generate the mid-point WACC estimates for Enable are summarised in Table 2 below.⁷

Table 2: Values used to calculate WACC estimates*

Parameter	Estimate
Risk-free rate	4.73%
Average debt premium	1.45%
Leverage	29%
Asset beta	0.50
Equity beta	0.70
Tax-adjusted market risk premium	7.5%
Average corporate tax rate	28%
Average investor tax rate	28%
Debt issuance costs	0.33%
Cost of debt	6.51%
Cost of equity	8.65%

See Commerce Commission, <u>Fibre Input Methodologies Determination 2020</u> [2020] NZCC 21 (consolidated 6 March 2024) and Commerce Commission, <u>Guidelines for WACC determinations under the cost of capital input methodologies (pre-IM review version)</u> (27 June 2024).

See Commerce Commission, <u>Fibre Input Methodologies (tax-adjusted market risk premium) Amendment Determination 2024</u> [2024] NZCC 11 (28 May 2024), clause 3.2.1.

All parameter values except the asset beta, estimate of the risk-free rate and the average debt premium are specified in the Fibre IMs. It should be noted, however, that the equity beta is calculated using the values of the asset beta and leverage, so this value of the asset beta is implicitly defined in the Fibre IMs. See Commerce Commission, Fibre input methodologies: Main final decisions – reasons paper (13 October 2020), para 6.411.

Standard error of mid-point WACC estimate	0.0131		
Mid-point vanilla WACC	8.03%		
Mid-point post-tax WACC	7.50%		

^{*}The numbers are rounded to two decimal points, except for the taxadjusted market risk premium and standard error of the mid-point WACC estimate.

Risk-free rate

- 9. The risk-free rate reflects the estimated bid yield to maturity on New Zealand government bonds with a term to maturity equal to the length of the regulatory period (three years).8
- 10. Our estimate of the three-year risk-free rate is based on data reported by Bloomberg for the three-month period ending 30 June 2024 in respect of the May 2026, April 2027, and May 2028 maturity bonds.
- 11. The daily data reported by Bloomberg is linearly interpolated, annualised (to reflect the six-monthly payment of interest) and averaged to produce the estimate of 4.73% interest rate on New Zealand government bonds with a three-year term to maturity, as estimated at 1 July 2024.⁹

Average debt premium

12. The average debt premium of 1.45% is the average of the debt premium values for the current debt premium reference year (DPRY) and the four previous DPRYs, as shown in Table 3 below. DPRY 2024 is the current debt premium reference year.

Table 3: Average debt premium for Enable (%)

	DPRY	DPRY	DPRY	DPRY	DPRY	Avorago
	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	Average
Debt premium	1.70	1.70	1.30	1.15	1.40	1.45

We interpolate between the two closest bonds surrounding a three-year remaining term. This requires taking the yields of the bonds with a remaining term immediately before and after a three-year term to maturity on that day. The target term to maturity is constant but the bonds' remaining terms to maturity decrease over time, so the bonds immediately before and after the target term may change over time.

Note that the target term to maturity for the risk-free rate and debt premium are different for the first regulatory period (the risk-free rate has a term equal to the length of the regulatory period, i.e., three years for the first regulatory period, and the debt premium has a five-year term). See Commerce Commission, Fibre input methodologies: Main final decisions – Reasons paper (13 October 2020), paras 6.81 to 6.264.

- 13. The DPRYs for all regulated fibre service providers start on 1 September and end on 31 August. 10 DPRY 2024 (the DPRY ending 31 August 2024), is the current DPRY for Enable as it contains the start of disclosure year 2025 (1 July 2024). The Fibre IMs state that the calculation of the debt premium for a DPRY is estimated for each business day in the 12 months preceding the start of the DPRY. This means that for all the DPRYs we have used bond data starting on 1 September and ending on 31 August.
- 14. The debt premium values are taken from the following sources:
 - 14.1 The debt premium values for DPRYs 2020 to 2021 were estimated in the WACC determination for Chorus Limited's first PQ path in July 2021.¹¹
 - 14.2 The debt premium value for DPRY 2022 was estimated in the ID WACC determination published on 1 February 2022 applying to Chorus, Enable, Tuatahi and Northpower Fibre. 12
 - 14.3 The debt premium value for DPRY 2023 was estimated in the ID WACC determination published on 1 February 2023 applying to Chorus.¹³
 - 14.4 The debt premium value for DPRY 2024 was estimated in the ID WACC determination published on 7 February 2024 applying to Chorus. ¹⁴
- 15. When determining the WACC estimates for Chorus' first price-quality path, we estimated the historical debt premium estimates to calculate the five-year historical average. A summary of the data used and how we have applied our judgement in determining the debt premiums for DPRYs 2020 to DPRY 2021 are described in the Cost of capital determination for Chorus' first price-quality path.¹⁵

Changes in the risk-free rates and debt premium over time

- 16. The risk-free rate and the debt premium on bonds change over time. Changes in the risk-free rate and debt premium estimates are illustrated below.
- 17. Figure 1 shows, as at 1 July 2024, changes over time in the:

Commerce Commission, Fibre Input Methodologies Determination 2020 [2020] NZCC 21 (as amended), clause 1.1.4.

¹¹ Commerce Commission, <u>Cost of capital determination for Chorus' price quality path for PQP1</u>, NZCC 8 [2021], 1 July 2021.

Commerce Commission, Cost of capital determination for Chorus, Enable, Tuatahi, and Northpower Fibre ID [2022] NZCC 1, 1 February 2022.

¹³ Commerce Commission, <u>Cost of capital determination disclosure year 2023 for information disclosure regulation</u>, <u>For Chorus Limited</u> [2023] NZCC 1, 1 February 2023.

¹⁴ Commerce Commission, <u>Cost of capital determination for disclosure year 2024 for information disclosure regulation</u>, <u>For Chorus Limited</u> [2024] NZCC 1, 7 February 2024.

Commerce Commission, Cost of capital determination for Chorus' price quality path for PQP1, NZCC 8 [2021], 1 July 2021, paras 17-18.

- 17.1 five-year risk-free rate from our historical determinations in other regulated sectors;
- 17.2 three-year risk-free rate; and
- 17.3 debt premiums and five-year average debt premiums on bonds rated BBB with a term of five years from our historical debt premium determinations.

Figure 1: Changes in Fibre debt premiums, three-year and five-year risk-free rates over time

