

13 February 2014

Pharmacy  
Address

Dear Sir/Madam

### **Commerce Act 1986: Warning**

1. The purpose of this letter is to warn the pharmacy above that certain provisions in the 2012 Community Pharmacy Services Agreement (CPSA) were likely in breach of section 27 of the Commerce Act 1986 (the Act).
2. We have reached this view after investigating the 'no discounting' provisions in the District Health Boards (DHBs) 2012 CPSA with individual community pharmacies. Our view is that provisions M1.3 and H4.4 of the CPSA (the 'no discounting' provisions) had the likely effect of substantially lessening competition for the dispensing of prescription medication.
3. In making a decision to warn rather than to take some other enforcement action, we have taken into account that the extent of the detriment was limited. Following our intervention and the DHBs' prompt response to our concerns, the provisions were not enforced by DHBs from December 2012 and the provisions were removed from the CPSA with effect from 1 March 2013. We also recognise that individual pharmacies had limited ability to vary the CPSA and remove the no discounting provisions had they wished to do so.

### **Commission warning**

4. Section 27 of the Act prohibits contracts arrangements or understandings containing a provision that has the purpose, effect or likely effect of substantially lessening competition in a market in New Zealand.
5. In our view, the 'no discounting' provisions were drafted to ensure that pharmacies did not discount the co-payment or try to encourage customers with some other form of inducement to obtain prescriptions from their pharmacy.
6. In the Commission's view, pharmacies compete with each other in localised markets and the no discounting provisions had the likely effect of substantially lessening competition during the time they were in force.
7. Before the CPSA was signed, some pharmacies competed on the price of prescription medication, typically by discounting the patient co-payment. This competition was in our view beneficial, especially to those customers in low-income communities.

**AUCKLAND**

L19, ASB Building  
135 Albert Street  
P.O. Box 105-222  
AUCKLAND 1143, NEW ZEALAND  
1669527.1

**WELLINGTON**

L6, 44 The Terrace  
P.O. Box 2351  
WELLINGTON 6140, NEW ZEALAND  
Tel: (04) 924 3600 Fax: (04) 924 3700  
Main Office

**CHRISTCHURCH**

9 Radley Street  
Woolston  
P.O. Box 10-199  
CHRISTCHURCH 8145, NEW ZEALAND

8. Following the signing of the CPSA, some pharmacies who had discounted, observed a decline in prescriptions dispensed while the no discounting provisions were in operation.

#### **Commission view**

9. Competition between firms typically derives from rivalry on price, quality, service, choice and other offerings. Conduct which substantially lessens competition can be very detrimental to consumers.
10. To avoid breaching the Act via any future CPSAs, we urge you to carefully consider, before signing such agreements, whether there are any provisions that may have the effect of substantially lessening competition. If in doubt, seek advice.
11. We remind you that pharmacies are in competition with other pharmacies in their local area for dispensing and for non-prescription products. Each pharmacy needs to reach independent pricing decisions to avoid the risk of breaching the Act.
12. We also encourage you to take an interest in what member associations or pharmacy groups may advocate on your behalf during any consultation process with DHBs. If you delegate to an association to reach terms on your behalf, you may be bound into an agreement that breaches the Act.

#### **Further action by the Commission and other parties**

13. Only the courts can decide whether the Act has been breached or not. This warning letter does not represent a ruling of law.
14. The Commission does not intend to take any further action against you for this conduct. However, you should be aware that our decision to issue this warning letter does not prevent any other person or entity from taking private action through the courts.
15. The court can impose penalties where it finds the law has been broken. An individual can be fined a maximum of \$500,000 and/or be prohibited from being a company director or a manager of a company. A body corporate can be fined the greater of \$10 million, or three times the commercial gain from the breach (if this cannot be easily established, 10% of turnover). Every separate breach of the Act may incur a penalty.
16. The Commission will also be warning DHBs and all other individual pharmacies who entered into the 2012 CPSA that they have likely breached the Act. The Pharmacy Guild of New Zealand (the Guild) will also be warned for aiding, abetting, counselling or procuring DHBs and/or its members to include the provisions.

#### **Publication**

17. The warning letters are public information and a generic version of the letters to DHBs, pharmacies and the letter to the Guild will be published on our website. We

also intend to make public comment including issuing a media release and making comment to media.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of a stylized, cursive 'R' followed by a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Ritchie Hutton  
Head of Investigations  
Commerce Commission